

From Plato to Cormac McCarthy: Mathematics as Metaphor

Dan Sloughter

December 29, 2025

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.
 - The shadows are from objects paraded in front of a fire behind us.

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.
 - The shadows are from objects paraded in front of a fire behind us.
 - Reality, the world of forms, is outside the cave, in the light of the sun.

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.
 - The shadows are from objects paraded in front of a fire behind us.
 - Reality, the world of forms, is outside the cave, in the light of the sun.
- Mathematical objects are the prime example of the forms outside the cave.

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.
 - The shadows are from objects paraded in front of a fire behind us.
 - Reality, the world of forms, is outside the cave, in the light of the sun.
- Mathematical objects are the prime example of the forms outside the cave.
- Mathematics provides a bridge between the world of forms and and our sensible world of contingent existence.

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.
 - The shadows are from objects paraded in front of a fire behind us.
 - Reality, the world of forms, is outside the cave, in the light of the sun.
- Mathematical objects are the prime example of the forms outside the cave.
- Mathematics provides a bridge between the world of forms and our sensible world of contingent existence.
- **What if there is no outside?**

It begins with Plato

- Allegory of the cave:
 - Our sensory input is of nothing more than shadows cast on the wall of cave.
 - The shadows are from objects paraded in front of a fire behind us.
 - Reality, the world of forms, is outside the cave, in the light of the sun.
- Mathematical objects are the prime example of the forms outside the cave.
- Mathematics provides a bridge between the world of forms and and our sensible world of contingent existence.
- What if there is no outside?
- What if there are no objects behind us? That is, what if the shadows are all there is?

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):
[W]e may define the real as that whose characters are independent of what anybody may think them to be.

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):
[W]e may define the real as that whose characters are independent of what anybody may think them to be.
- How far are we removed from reality?

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):
[W]e may define the real as that whose characters are independent of what anybody may think them to be.
- How far are we removed from reality?
- We can only describe what our senses give to us. How effective are our senses?

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):
[W]e may define the real as that whose characters are independent of what anybody may think them to be.
- How far are we removed from reality?
- We can only describe what our senses give to us. How effective are our senses?
- Thomas Aquinas (in *Quaestiones disputatae de veritate*):

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):
[W]e may define the real as that whose characters are independent of what anybody may think them to be.
- How far are we removed from reality?
- We can only describe what our senses give to us. How effective are our senses?
- Thomas Aquinas (in *Quaestiones disputatae de veritate*):
Nihil est in intellectu quod non sit prius in sensu.

What is real?

- C. S. Peirce (in *How to Make Our Ideas Clear*, 1878):
[W]e may define the real as that whose characters are independent of what anybody may think them to be.
- How far are we removed from reality?
- We can only describe what our senses give to us. How effective are our senses?
- Thomas Aquinas (in *Quaestiones disputatae de veritate*):
Nihil est in intellectu quod non sit prius in sensu.
- How would we model the world if our senses were different?

σώζειν τά φαινόμενα

- In considering the motion of the planets, Simplicius (6th century) tells us:

σώζειν τά φαινόμενα

- In considering the motion of the planets, Simplicius (6th century) tells us:

Not being able to grasp with precision how what occurs in the heaven is only the appearance of their condition and not the truth, the <astronomers> were content to find out on what hypotheses the phenomena concerning the stars which are said to wander could be preserved by means of uniform, ordered, circular motions. And, as Eudemus recorded in the second book of his astronomical history (and Sosigenes took this over from Eudemus), Eudoxus of Cnidus is said to be the first of the Hellenes to have made use of such hypotheses, Plato (as Sosigenes says) having created this problem for those who had concerned themselves with these things: on what hypotheses of uniform and ordered motions could the phenomena concerning the motions of the planets be preserved?

σώζειν τά φαινόμενα

- In considering the motion of the planets, Simplicius (6th century) tells us:

Not being able to grasp with precision how what occurs in the heaven is only the appearance of their condition and not the truth, the <astronomers> were content to find out on what hypotheses the phenomena concerning the stars which are said to wander could be preserved by means of uniform, ordered, circular motions. And, as Eudemus recorded in the second book of his astronomical history (and Sosigenes took this over from Eudemus), Eudoxus of Cnidus is said to be the first of the Hellenes to have made use of such hypotheses, Plato (as Sosigenes says) having created this problem for those who had concerned themselves with these things: on what hypotheses of uniform and ordered motions could the phenomena concerning the motions of the planets be preserved?

- To this, W. V. Quine adds (quoting Sherwin-Williams):

σώζειν τά φαινόμενα

- In considering the motion of the planets, Simplicius (6th century) tells us:

Not being able to grasp with precision how what occurs in the heaven is only the appearance of their condition and not the truth, the <astronomers> were content to find out on what hypotheses the phenomena concerning the stars which are said to wander could be preserved by means of uniform, ordered, circular motions. And, as Eudemus recorded in the second book of his astronomical history (and Sosigenes took this over from Eudemus), Eudoxus of Cnidus is said to be the first of the Hellenes to have made use of such hypotheses, Plato (as Sosigenes says) having created this problem for those who had concerned themselves with these things: on what hypotheses of uniform and ordered motions could the phenomena concerning the motions of the planets be preserved?

- To this, W. V. Quine adds (quoting Sherwin-Williams):

Save the surface and you save all.

Numbers and reality

- Commenting on the *Timeaus*, Proclus (5th century) warns us not to identify numbers with physical reality:

Numbers and reality

- Commenting on the *Timeaus*, Proclus (5th century) warns us not to identify numbers with physical reality:

But on the other hand, it is also necessary not to dwell [too much] on the mathematical [parts of the dialogue] as some do. For this too engenders false opinions in the audience in as much as they come to think of physical figures being the same thing as mathematical numbers.

Numbers and reality

- Commenting on the *Timaeus*, Proclus (5th century) warns us not to identify numbers with physical reality:

But on the other hand, it is also necessary not to dwell [too much] on the mathematical [parts of the dialogue] as some do. For this too engenders false opinions in the audience in as much as they come to think of physical figures being the same thing as mathematical numbers.

- In his own commentary on the *Timaeus*, William of Conches (12th century) describes how numbers refer to the world:

Numbers and reality

- Commenting on the *Timaeus*, Proclus (5th century) warns us not to identify numbers with physical reality:

But on the other hand, it is also necessary not to dwell [too much] on the mathematical [parts of the dialogue] as some do. For this too engenders false opinions in the audience in as much as they come to think of physical figures being the same thing as mathematical numbers.

- In his own commentary on the *Timaeus*, William of Conches (12th century) describes how numbers refer to the world:

Indeed, numbers are referred to things in three ways: magnitude, similarity, order.

What conforms to what

- From the preface to the second edition of the *Critique of Pure Reason*:

What conforms to what

- From the preface to the second edition of the *Critique of Pure Reason*:

Up to now it has been assumed that all our cognition must conform to the objects; but all attempts to find out something about them a priori through concepts that would extend our cognition have, on this presupposition, come to nothing. Hence let us once try whether we do not get farther with the problems of metaphysics by assuming that the objects must conform to our cognition, which would agree better with the requested possibility of an a priori cognition of them, which is to establish something about objects before they are given to us.

What is it like?

- How would we model the world if our senses were different?

What is it like?

- How would we model the world if our senses were different?
- Thomas Nagel and Timothy Sprigge asked: What is it like to be a different creature?

What is it like?

- How would we model the world if our senses were different?
- Thomas Nagel and Timothy Sprigge asked: What is it like to be a different creature?
- For example, what is it like to be a bat? Or a dog?

What is it like?

- How would we model the world if our senses were different?
- Thomas Nagel and Timothy Sprigge asked: What is it like to be a different creature?
- For example, what is it like to be a bat? Or a dog?
- **Or a robin?**

What is it like?

- How would we model the world if our senses were different?
- Thomas Nagel and Timothy Sprigge asked: What is it like to be a different creature?
- For example, what is it like to be a bat? Or a dog?
- Or a robin?
- Is this even conceivable to us?

Conscious vs. subconscious mind

- Henri Poincaré in *Science et Méthode*:

Conscious vs. subconscious mind

- Henri Poincaré in *Science et Méthode*:

Les péripéties du voyage me firent oublier mes travaux mathématiques; arrivés à Coutances, nous montâmes dans un omnibus pour je ne sais quelle promenade; au moment où je mettais le pied sur le marche-pied, l'idée me vint, sans que rien dans mes pensées antérieures parût m'y avoir préparé, que les transformations dont, j'avais fait usage pour définir les fonctions fuchsiennes étaient identiques à celles de la géométrie non-euclidienne.

Conscious vs. subconscious mind

- Henri Poincaré in *Science et Méthode*:

Les péripéties du voyage me firent oublier mes travaux mathématiques; arrivés à Coutances, nous montâmes dans un omnibus pour je ne sais quelle promenade; au moment où je mettais le pied sur le marche-pied, l'idée me vint, sans que rien dans mes pensées antérieures parût m'y avoir préparé, que les transformations dont, j'avais fait usage pour définir les fonctions fuchsiennes étaient identiques à celles de la géométrie non-euclidienne.

- Cormac McCarthy recalls a similar story about August Kekulé and his discovery of the structure of benzene in a dream.

Paintings on the walls

- Antonio Machado, quoted by David Ruelle:

Paintings on the walls

- Antonio Machado, quoted by David Ruelle:

Caminante, son tus huellas

el camino y nada mas;

caminante, no hay camino,

se hace camino al andar.

[Walker, your footsteps

are the path, the path is nothing more;

walker, there is no path.

You make the path by walking.]

Paintings on the walls

- Antonio Machado, quoted by David Ruelle:

*Caminante, son tus huellas
el camino y nada mas;
caminante, no hay camino,
se hace camino al andar.*

*[Walker, your footsteps
are the path, the path is nothing more;
walker, there is no path.
You make the path by walking.]*

- Cormac McCarthy (*The Passenger*)

Paintings on the walls

- Antonio Machado, quoted by David Ruelle:

*Caminante, son tus huellas
el camino y nada mas;
caminante, no hay camino,
se hace camino al andar.*

*[Walker, your footsteps
are the path, the path is nothing more;
walker, there is no path.*

You make the path by walking.]

- Cormac McCarthy (*The Passenger*)

*She knew that in the end you really cant know. You cant get hold of the world.
You can only draw a picture. Whether it's a bull on the wall of a cave or a partial
differential equation it's all the same thing.*

Philosophical problems

- Perhaps the philosophical problems of mathematics are beyond satisfactory answers, and all we can hope for is a patchwork of solutions.

Philosophical problems

- Perhaps the philosophical problems of mathematics are beyond satisfactory answers, and all we can hope for is a patchwork of solutions.
- As G. H. Hardy notes in his *A Mathematician's Apology*:

Philosophical problems

- Perhaps the philosophical problems of mathematics are beyond satisfactory answers, and all we can hope for is a patchwork of solutions.
- As G. H. Hardy notes in his *A Mathematician's Apology*:
A man who could give a convincing account of mathematical reality would have solved very many of the most difficult problems of metaphysics. If he could include physical reality in his account, he would have solved them all.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. *Pursuit of Truth*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. *Pursuit of Truth*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Passenger*. New York: Knopf, 2022.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. *Pursuit of Truth*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Passenger*. New York: Knopf, 2022.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Kekulé Problem*. Nautilus, Mar/Apr 2017. 22-31.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. *Pursuit of Truth*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Passenger*. New York: Knopf, 2022.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Kekulé Problem*. Nautilus, Mar/Apr 2017. 22-31.
- Nagel, Thomas. *What is it like to be a bat*. The Philosophical Review. Oct., 1974, Vol. 83, No. 4 (Oct., 1974), pp. 435-450

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. *Pursuit of Truth*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Passenger*. New York: Knopf, 2022.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Kekulé Problem*. Nautilus, Mar/Apr 2017. 22-31.
- Nagel, Thomas. *What is it like to be a bat*. The Philosophical Review. Oct., 1974, Vol. 83, No. 4 (Oct., 1974), pp. 435-450
- Sprigge, Timothy. *Final Causes*. Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volumes, 1971, Vol. 45 (1971), pp. 149-170.

Some references

- Proclus. *Commentary on Plato's Timaeus*. Edited and translated by Dirk Baltzly. Vol. III. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Simplicius. *On Aristotle: On the Heavens 2.10-14*. Translated by Ian Mueller. London: Bloomsbury, 2005.
- Ruelle, David. *Is Our Mathematics Natural? The Case of Equilibrium Statistical Mechanics*. Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society, Vol. 19, No. 1. July, 1988. 259-268.
- Quine, W. V. *Pursuit of Truth*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Passenger*. New York: Knopf, 2022.
- McCarthy, Cormac. *The Kekulé Problem*. Nautilus, Mar/Apr 2017. 22-31.
- Nagel, Thomas. *What is it like to be a bat*. The Philosophical Review. Oct., 1974, Vol. 83, No. 4 (Oct., 1974), pp. 435-450
- Sprigge, Timothy. *Final Causes*. Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volumes, 1971, Vol. 45 (1971), pp. 149-170.
- Poincaré, Henri. *Science and méthode*. Paris: Flammarion, 1920.